BRIGHAM’S BASTION: "WINSOR CASTLE" AT PIPE SPRINGS AND ITS PLACE IN THE GREAT GAME

John A. Peterson
March 23, 2016
The Juanita Brooks Lecture Series presents

The 33rd Annual Lecture

BRIGHAM’S BASTION:

“WINSOR CASTLE” AT PIPE SPRINGS AND ITS PLACE IN THE GREAT GAME

by John A. Peterson

St. George Tabernacle
March 23, 2016
7:00 P.M.

Co-sponsored by
Dixie State University Library
St. George, Utah
and the Obert C. Tanner Foundation
Juanita Brooks was a professor at [then] Dixie College for many years and became a well-known author.

She is recognized, by scholarly consent, to be one of Utah’s and Mormondom’s most eminent historians. Her total honesty, unwavering courage, and perceptive interpretation of fact set more stringent standards of scholarship for her fellow historians to emulate. Dr. Obert C. and Grace Tanner had been lifelong friends of Mrs. Brooks and it was their wish to perpetuate her work through this lecture series. Dixie State University and the Brooks family express their thanks to the Tanner family.
John A. Peterson graduated from Utah State University with a B.A. in History in 1980. While an undergraduate at Logan, he worked as an archivist in the Merrill Library, and spent four months as an intern at the Utah State Historical Society. He received an M.A. in History from Brigham Young University in 1985, and a Ph.D. in History from Arizona State University in 1993. He married the former Linda Israelsen in 1979. They have raised 5 children and have 10 grandchildren, some of whom reside in St. George.

John has been employed by the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints for the past 36 years. In 1980 he started teaching Seminary for the Church Education System at Viewmont Seminary in Bountiful, Utah. From 1986 to 1988 he worked as an archivist and 19th-Century acquisitions specialist in the Church Historical Department. In 1992 he was appointed to teach Institute at the Salt Lake University Institute of Religion adjacent to the University of Utah where he has taught for nearly a quarter century. He teaches various scripture courses, LDS History, and Christian History. He has also taught many years for Brigham Young University Division of Continuing Education, and in 1990 received the Division Faculty Award for 1990.

John is a member of the Mormon History Association and the Organization of American Historians. In 1998 he published a monograph on Mormon-Indian Relations entitled Utah’s Black Hawk War for which he won the Mormon History Association’s Best First Book award for that year. During that time, he studied Mormon-Indian Relations in the St. George region and became interested in Winsor Castle at Pipe Springs. In 2009, the National Park Service hired him to write a historic research study of Pipe Spring National Monument. This 800 page single-spaced work is entitled “Brigham’s Bastion: Winsor Castle at Pipe Springs and its Place on the Mormon Frontier” and currently is in the process of being shortened and edited for publication. John loves Utah’s Dixie and members of his extended family have lived here since it was first settled. His family owns a cabin in Pine Valley and he particularly enjoys four-wheeling the back roads of southern Utah and the Arizona Strip.
Introduction

About sixty miles east of St. George, at the base of what Frederick S. Dellenbaugh described as “one of the longest and finest cliff ranges anywhere to be seen,” sits one of the few pioneer Mormon forts still in existence. From 1847 to well into the 1880s there were literally scores of forts built throughout Mormondom. The fort Brigham Young directed to be built at Pipe Springs was unique, however, because of its strategic location, its political and military significance, as well as its innovative design and superb construction. Named by the grand colonizer himself, “Winsor Castle” today stands in the southwest quadrant of the Kaibab Indian Reservation about thirty miles north of the Grand Canyon. It is located on the main road from St. George to Kanab and is situated about three miles south of Moccasin, Arizona, eight miles south of the Utah-Arizona line, and fifteen miles southeast of the modern polygamist haven of Colorado City. Today Brigham Young’s old rock fortress is owned by the Federal Government and is officially known as Pipe Spring National Monument.

As a national shrine, the place is obviously intended to memorialize something of “national” importance. Unfortunately, until very recently, a great deal of what this monument could help us remember has been totally obscured by the past. In fact, when this old pioneer structure was declared a national monument by President Warren G. Harding in 1923, its primary purpose was to provide drinking water and toilet facilities for tourists traveling the lonely road between Zion Canyon, Bryce Canyon, and Grand Canyon national parks. In the mind of National Park Service director Stephen T. Mather, its historical significance was simply that it was representative of general ranch life in the great American southwest. Until recently, not even the National Park Service wards that preserve Winsor Castle and interpret its history for the public have understood the full extent of its tremendous national significance. This paper seeks to restore Winsor Castle at Pipe Springs to its rightful place as an important relic of a decades long conflict between the United States government and the Latter-day Saint theocracy. It was a conflict, which was then sometimes called “the Great Game.”
The Prophet’s small but impressively built red-sandstone fortress on the Arizona Strip was conceptualized and erected between February 1870 and September 1872. This was a crucial epoch in the history of the American West. It was a time in which two of the most powerful leaders of the entire era, Brigham Young and Ulysses S. Grant, along with their respective constituents, considered themselves to be on the very brink of war. At issue, of course, was Mormon polygamy, and more importantly, the fact that Young and his people were attempting to establish a theocratic kingdom in the heartland of the American Democratic Republic. As we shall see, Brigham’s Bastion at Pipe Springs was built for a number of reasons. One of them was to personally protect Brigham Young from federal prosecution for polygamy, murder, treason and other alleged crimes related to the Utah War and the Mountain Meadows Massacre. Another was that the fort was to potentially serve as a command center for the Nauvoo Legion, a church controlled army, at a time President Ulysses S. Grant and a “radical republican” congress contemplated sending 40,000 troops to “reconstruct” the theocratic Territory of Utah.

In late 1869 and early 1870 a number of stringent anti-polygamy bills were considered by Congress. One of the most extreme was sponsored by Shelby Cullom, the Chairman of the House Committee on Territories. The Cullom Bill originally called for 40,000 troops, “partly regulars and partly volunteers,” to be sent to Utah to enforce the Morrill anti-bigamy Act of 1862. As the House debated various forms of the bill in February 1870, newspapers throughout the country prophesied the nation was on the brink of a second Civil War. As it covered the debate, the New York World reported that the bill’s provisions would result in the imprisonment of over five thousand Mormons guilty of practicing polygamy “and the confiscation of over fifty millions of dollars’ worth of property.” Assessing the situation, the World prognosticated: “This bill means war….We do not believe that any one who comprehends the system and spirit of Brigham Young…can doubt that the Mormons are prepared to assume a belligerent attitude if the principles of Cullom’s bill are enforced against them by military power.”

While other papers hoped the Saints would simply flee en masse to Mexico, the World wagered that “they will not resort to flight in the direction of Mexico or else[where] — not, at least, until they have made an effort to hold their ground in Utah.” Contemplating a fight between the Mormons and the United States, the Cincinnati Daily Gazette wondered,

And when we have conquered these people, what a deplorable picture shall we have created! There is no political, religious or moral demand for
such a crusade. What it would accomplish by successful war, would be such a moral picture as would make fiends laugh. Polygamy will die sooner than we could kill it with an army of a quarter of a million. Let us not give it new life by watering it with blood.\(^6\)

Seizing on Eastern fears, Young let it be known that his people would indeed fight if his kingdom was invaded. He nonetheless promptly left on an expedition to explore an exodus route to Arizona and Mexico. Meanwhile, Shelby Cullom thundered from the floor of the House that “the American people, fresh from a triumph over a great rebellion” in the South, would not “shrink from an attempt to enforce the laws over such a small body of people” as one hundred thousand Mormons. Shorn of its worst provisions, the Cullom bill passed the House on 23 March 1870. Lucky for the Mormons, Eastern friends like Thomas L. Kane helped the Cullom bill die a quiet death without ever reaching the floor of the Senate.\(^7\) Long before Young would know that fact, however, a spurious telegram he ironically received on April Fool’s Day falsely reported that “the Cullom bill passed the senate by a majority of 102” votes and that General William Tecumseh Sherman had already issued the order to call up “40,000 troops…for immediate service” against the Mormons. Whether it was a malicious falsehood, or, considering the date, some Eastern telegrapher’s idea of a good joke, this telegram changed history and prompted Young to decide to build a sanctuary in the Pipe Springs desert.\(^8\)

From the start Young named his bastion “Windsor Castle.” The place was ostensibly named in honor of Anson Perry Winsor, the primary superintendent of the fort’s construction and the man Young tapped to watch over the massive tithing herds that Grant’s threats of confiscation forced him to move into the area. But there was more to the name than that. Unlike the spelling of Anson Winsor’s surname, the prophet originally spelled “Windsor Castle” with a “d.” The much more famous Windsor Castle in Berkshire, England, is, of course, the oldest and largest inhabited castle in the world. Having successfully protected the English Monarchy for nearly a thousand years, even in Young’s day it was a potent symbol of monarchical power. To the prophet and the thousands of former British subjects over which he presided, the name “Windsor Castle” was packed with significance. Brigham Young may well have originally used its English spelling to signal what he hoped his tiny fortress on the Arizona Strip would mean for the survival of his own kingdom — and especially for the survival of its monarch.\(^9\)

It must be emphasized from the start that like most structures built by Mormons, the fort at Pipe Springs, was “multi-purpose” in function. It
served as a Nauvoo Legion headquarters commanding a strategic bottleneck in a series of important trails used by Ute, Paiute, and Navajo raiders during the Latter-day Saints’ most serious Indian conflicts.\(^{10}\) It also served as a symbolic claim stake driven into parched desert soil to secure possession for the Mormons of tens of thousands of square miles of prime grazing land on the Utah-Arizona line. Literally walling in one of the two most important water sources in this arid region (Pipe Springs), its location on the point of a cove in the Vermilion cliffs commanded the other (nearby Moccasin Springs). Pipe’s unique bottleneck topography, coupled with its near complete control of water on the road through its desert, produced an effectual gate allowing the Latter-day Saints to control all traffic through what was then a rich herd ground composed of lush desert grasses.\(^{11}\)

**The Multi-purpose Nature of “Winsor Castle”**

It is a well known fact that one of the primary purposes for Winsor Castle’s construction was to protect the church’s all-important tithing herd from Native American raiders. Far less known, however, is the fact that Brigham’s bastion at Pipe Springs was also built to protect Church tithing stock from what the prophet considered to be far more “pernicious thieves,” i.e. the Grant Administration and the United States Congress. In 1862 Congress passed the Morrill Anti Bigamy Act forbidding plural marriage and allowing the Federal Government to weaken the Mormon theocracy in Utah by escheating to itself any church property over the amount of $50,000. The idea was to destroy Young’s theocratic power by emptying his purse through confiscation. The Civil War and Lincoln’s seeming lack of concern for “the Mormon Problem,” however, followed by the president’s tragic assassination and Andrew Johnson’s impeachment, all worked to hamstring the nation’s attempts to confiscate church property. With the inauguration of “Unconditional Surrender Grant” in March 1869, however, the new president announced his intention to enforce the 1862 law and destroy both polygamy and what he viewed as Young’s “despotism” in the Territory of Utah.

The easiest property for the Grant Administration to get its hands on were the Church’s massive tithing herds then held on northern Utah herd grounds in such places as Rush and Cache Valleys and especially on the Church’s primary herd ground on Antelope Island in the Great Salt Lake.\(^{12}\) While Grant impatiently waited for Congress to pass a bill like that sponsored by Shelby Cullom, he attempted to use the recently founded Internal Revenue Department to get at the source of the Prophet’s tithing wealth.\(^{13}\) Utah’s federal tax assessor and his collectors, one of whom was a son-in-law of Grant’s
vice-president Schuyler Colfax, were willing tools of the administration. Under Grant’s prodding, late in 1869 the Internal Revenue Department briefly (and illegally) ruled that tithing paid to the Mormon Church was to be viewed as personal income for Brigham Young. With this crafty classification, Church-owned tithing cattle could be seized to pay for the Prophet’s “unpaid” personal income taxes, which Young was suddenly now personally assessed on the huge sum of all tithing accumulated over the years.

In January 1870, Young temporarily suspended the payment of church tithes altogether, lest they fall into the hands of what he called “the enemy.” Meanwhile he stalled for time by appealing the Internal Revenue Department’s decision. Simultaneously he took steps to get his tithing animals out of the reach of the federal collectors in northern Utah. His plan was to move the tithing herds as far away as possible from the railroads in northern Utah that could haul them away. For a time he actually contemplated moving his herds, himself, and Church headquarters too, into Mexico, or at least into unsettled regions deep in Arizona. As we have seen, however, in April 1870, while on a major expedition of discovery in which he originally planned to explore prime grazing country around modern day Flagstaff, he also visited the plateau country east of St. George as far as Kanab. An unusually wet winter and spring had caused desert grasses growing east of the Hurricane fault, south of the Vermilion Cliffs, and north of the Grand Canyon to spring up in exuberant luxuriance right at the time of his visit, producing a somewhat skewed vision of the area’s resources. He found that the jagged cliffs and “magnificent mountains” that made up the Hurricane Fault, the Virgin River Gorge, the Vermilion Cliffs, and the Grand Canyon itself sheltered a lush desert herd ground that could easily be defended by Mormon militiamen. Overcome by the richness of the desert’s spring grasses protectively enclosed in this natural mountain bastion, Grant’s nemesis determined to preserve his herds (and the future of his kingdom) in the then almost inaccessible country between the Hurricane Fault and the Kaibab Plateau. While some of Young’s contemporaries called this whole region “the Pipe Springs Plateau” (after the area’s most dependable water source), in this crisis caused by Grant’s movements against him, the prophet gave the region a new name. Parroting the Bible, he called it “the Land of Canaan” after the refuge the polygamous patriarchs Abraham, Isaac and Jacob found in the deserts of Israel when they too had to flee with their livestock from enemies in richer lands to the north.

On 18 April 1870 Brigham Young gave the go-ahead for Apostle Erastus Snow to purchase the Pipe Springs Ranch from its previous owner, Elizabeth Whitmore. The same day he directed Snow to send Anson Winsor to
prepare his “New Canaan” to receive the northern tithing herds by moving his family to Pipe Springs where he proposed building a new fort to aid in protecting the tithing cattle from federal confiscation and from Indians. In addition the fort would protect stock owned by private cooperative cattle companies the prophet now authorized to move onto his New Canaan range. Following Young’s directions cooperative herds would soon be established at Pipe Springs, Kanab, Moccasin, Short Creek, and a herd ground near Andrus Springs which was soon renamed Canaan Ranch. Part of the cooperative movement Young had commenced several years before, these companies were designed to enrich church members while keeping non-Mormons, called Gentiles by the Saints, out of Mormondom. Thus Winsor Castle came to serve as a fortified ranch house, bunkhouse, mess hall, and makeshift cowboy stag-dance floor for various Mormon cooperative cattle companies playing their part in Brigham Young’s massive economic strategy to keep Gentiles from overrunning his Zion. Because of its water, its location on a nexus of important trails, and its protective walls and stock yards, Winsor Castle at Pipe Springs was also used as a staging ground and gathering spot for members of various missionary expeditions heading to the Indians beyond the Colorado River crossings and related emigration groups contemplating Mormon expansion into Arizona and Mexico.

Meanwhile Winsor Castle was the headquarters of a Church-owned beef producing operation and housed a cheese and butter “factory” designed to play a leading role in funding the construction of the St. George Temple in a “bootstrap” pioneer barter economy. At a time Brigham Young contemplated moving Church headquarters to St. George, not only did Winsor Castle become a regular church tithing office, but its tithing beef paid for temple rock, lumber, nails and lime, and for some of the labor necessary to put them together. Winsor Castle’s tithing stock provided beef steak for “missionary” construction workers who finished the St. George Tabernacle and built the St. George Temple, and its one hundred-cow dairy provided them with necessary cheese and butter. For years “Scrip” issued by the Winsor Castle Stock Growing Company and the Canaan Cooperative Cattle Company, which in time swallowed up the former, served as virtually the only “legal tender” in Dixie’s economy. A master at squeezing every possible benefit out of every single asset available to himself and his people, Brigham Young knew how to make the strategic, economic, and natural resources of the Pipe Springs area count. One of Winsor Castle’s least known contributions, but in some ways its
most important, was its designed role as a personal place of refuge for the Church president himself. It must be strongly emphasized that the fort was designed at a time Utah’s Federal officials were preparing to try the prophet for polygamy, murder, and for orchestrating the Mountain Meadows Massacre and other alleged Utah War Crimes. Built directly over the springs themselves, Winsor Castle was a fortified, watered, and well-provisioned hideout in an uncharted desert capable of sheltering the Mormon leader and a sizable Nauvoo Legion detachment necessary to defend him.

At the exact time Young was sending men accused of similar crimes like John D. Lee, William Dame, Isaac Haight, and Philip Klingensmith to hide in nearby Kanab, a primary purpose of Brigham’s bastion at Pipe Springs was to provide the prophet with a personal fortified desert refuge to ensure he would never be dragged off to a place like Carthage Jail and experience Joseph Smith’s fate at that hands of government authorities. 19

Young repeatedly announced that he would not go willingly into the custody of federal officials for trial, for fear that “the acts of Carthage jail” would be repeated. 20 In a rare criticism of Joseph Smith, Young said that if the Church’s first prophet “had followed the revelations in him” and fled into the wilderness as the Lord directed instead of submitting himself to the authorities, “he would have been our earthly shepherd to-day.” In a characteristic statement, Young said, “They may…undertake to try me in a Gentile court; I will see the government in hell fire first. I am ready to fight the government and the mob. I have soldiers, rifles, pistols and ammunition, and plenty of it, and cannon, too, and I will use them.” He often told the Saints “were I thrown into the situation Joseph was, I would leave the people and go into the wilderness, and let them do the best they could.” 21

Significantly, Brigham Young invented a strategy some of his fundamentalist followers practice to this day by locating his remote fortified “compound” just across the Utah-Arizona line so as to be out of the jurisdiction of Utah’s federal officials. At the same time, nearly impassible natural features such as the Hurricane Fault, the Vermilion Cliffs, the Grand Canyon, and Pipe’s waterless desert itself worked to limit the threat of officers or armies approaching from either Utah, Nevada, or Arizona. 22 Young personally selected the strategic location of the fort. He determined its size and design, oversaw the survey of the site, and initially placed a pair of trusted nephews, Joseph W. Young and John R. Young, in charge of its construction. He also directed the extension of the Deseret Telegraph to the site so that he, while in refuge, could still control and direct the minutiae of governing his Great Basin Kingdom from this remote Arizona safe-house should he ever need it. Significantly, the connection of Pipe Springs’ obscure desert castle to
the Deseret Telegraph Line coincided with the exact time he personally had need for such a desert refuge in the late fall of 1871. 23

The Great Game

To put Winsor Castle at Pipe Springs in an even larger context, it is important to examine what has been called “Brigham Young’s Great Game” and the roles Brigham Young and Ulysses Grant played in it. The term “the Great Game” is most often attributed to an officer of the English military who first used the term to refer to the chess-like moves and countermoves of the British and Russian empires as they fought each other for control over the deserts of Afghanistan, Turkestan, and Persia during the early nineteenth century. A foreign secretary of the British Empire explained that to him those far off desert kingdoms were simply “pieces on a chessboard upon which is being played out a game for the dominion of the world.” Not just any game, Queen Victoria articulated what was at stake when she said that seemingly insignificant and distant battles being fought in obscure deserts were being waged to settle the “question” as to whether Russia or Britain would be “supreme in the world.” 24

The term “Great Game” was also used at least as early as 1869 to describe the military, political, and religious strategies used by Brigham Young and representatives of the U.S. Government as they squared off against each other on a different desert chessboard. 25 Feeling called to establish a Kingdom in what became the heart of the American Democratic Republic, Young was sure he held Divine Keys authorizing his Great Basin Kingdom to eventually expand to fill the whole world and “break in pieces” and then “consume” all other political entities. 26 This long term goal, and the short term actions it dictated, were obviously considered “un-American” by most of Young’s contemporaries. They viewed the establishment of a kingdom inside the United States as counter-revolutionary to the American Revolution. Many of their own fathers had shed their blood in declaring independence from kings, kingdoms, and what they called “the tyranny of one man power.” Acting on behalf of their constituents, over the years Congress and a host of U.S. presidents, including James Polk, Zackary Taylor, Millard Fillmore, James Buchanan, and Ulysses Grant, engaged in a serious contest with Brigham Young for control of a huge chunk of the American West that included portions of what are now seven modern states. As in Victoria’s Great Game with the Russians, it was a question of supremacy. Was it to be the United States or the Mormon Church that was supreme in the American West?
A precursor to their church being driven out of the boundaries of the United States as they then existed, in 1845 Young and his fellow apostles fulfilled a commandment given to them by God himself by sending a provocative proclamation to the whole world. It was addressed “to all the Kings of the World, to the President of the United States of America; to the Governors of the several States; and to the Rulers and People of all Nations.” This 16-page, single spaced printed document invited the people and rulers of all nations in the name of Jesus Christ to join the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints in what it termed “the greatest of all revolutions.” Calling for the throwing down of all other thrones and powers and the immediate establishment of the Kingdom of God on Earth, the proclamation naturally inspired official ill-will toward Young and his associates in every clime to which their proclamation sounded. 27

Young viewed opposition to his “revolution,” especially that manifested by the United States Government, to be Satanic meddling with God’s Eternal Plan. Eager to fight and win on behalf of his Heavenly Master, he set the boundaries of his conflict and exhibited the depth of his determination for victory when he told a general conference of the church in 1851: “Evry [sic] thing is against Mormonism & Mormonism is against evry thing….we shall fight them untill the kingdom[s] of this world become the kingdom of our God. We shall fight Battle after Battle until the victory is won [or until we are forced to] lay down our lives for Christ sake.” 28 For reasons best known to himself, Young often called this eternal conflict a “game.” “We can beat the world at any game,” he declared in 1856, because we…hold the keys of the kingdom of God….We can pray the best, preach the best, and sing the best. We are the best looking and finest set of people on the face of the earth, and they may begin any game they please, and we are on hand, and can beat them at anything they have a mind to begin. They may make sharp their two-edged swords, and I will turn out the Elders of Israel with greased feathers, and whip them to death. We are not to be beat. 29

Young and his associates frequently spoke of “beating the devil at his own game,” “fighting the scalawags on their own ground,” or “hiring the wicked to fight the wicked.” 30 Anyone who has studied the life of Brigham Young closely knows that he was not above employing the same kinds of Great Game tricks, feints, bluff’s and mis-representations that his opponents did. During the Utah War, Young put the invading troops on notice that if they “wish to see a few tricks, we have ‘Mormons’ that can perform them.” He told an envoy from the Army “that if they persisted in making war upon us, I should share in their supplies.” And he made good on his promise in
more ways than one. In an 1869 interview with Lyman Trumbull, one of the most powerful men in the U.S. Senate, Young said: “We have been lied about enough, and will not stand it any longer.…Now...we intend to send out some of the same sort, and when we do, don’t believe mor’n [sic] half you hear.” In the early 1870s it was alleged that “the church authorities at Salt Lake [had dispersed] half a million dollars out of the tithing funds of Brigham Young, to buy newspaper influence and the votes of Congressmen.” By then the exigencies of the Great Game had turned Young into a consummate prevaricator. He kept his cards so close to his chest and bluffed so well that even some of his most trusted lieutenants were thrown off by his feints. Unfortunately for the modern historian, “the Great Gamer’s” dis-simulations have sometimes obscured our ability to grasp his true intentions. Did he really plan to use southern Utah’s Dixie as a battlefield upon which to fight the United States as he told the Saints and led federal officials to believe? Did he really intend on leaving northern Utah in ashes and leading the faithful to a new home in the south as he led even his closest advisors to believe? Perhaps he did not know himself, but was keeping his options open. And perhaps it does not really matter, for the bluff is at least as much a part of the game as the cards that are dealt and the ones that are finally played. Young, of course, did not divulge all of his reasons for building Winsor Castle to his co-religionists. He simply told them he was building a fort to protect tithing cattle from Indians and to provide beef and cheese for the builders of the St. George Temple, and to this day most of their faithful descendants look for no further explanation. The prophet’s word is good enough for them. While his simple explanation certainly was true, as we have seen and will further see, Young’s declared purpose for building the fort was only one card in a full deck — and the Joker was wild.

Perhaps modeling himself after the great Book of Mormon hero Captain Moroni (and certainly modeling himself after his predecessor Joseph Smith), Young “thought it no sin that he should defend [his people] by stratagem.” To play his game, Young employed spies and secret agents and even counter agents in systematic espionage. He hired lobbyists, retained powerful attorneys, and sent political “missionaries” to cultivate friendly relations with powerful senators, congressmen, and newspaper editors. He made strategic use of a host of non-Mormon business partners with powerful Washington connections. He and his agents cultivated friendships and political alliances wherever they could and mined all for intelligence. Special Eastern friends like Thomas Kane quietly worked in the shadows for him for decades. Young’s papers contain multiple examples of coded letters and telegrams written to and from the church
A world class statesman, Brigham Young had used provisions of the Northwest Ordinance of 1787 to set up a masterfully designed and executed (and strangely legal) system to allow his church controlled territorial legislature to authorize the local county probate courts with packed Latter-day Saint juries to try all criminal cases in Utah. For nearly twenty years this church controlled territorial judicial system was most often able to outmaneuver the Federal Court system and protect Mormons, including Young himself, from outside prosecution. This went for polygamists as well as for the accused perpetrators of the Mountain Meadows Massacre and a host of other alleged “Mormon Murders.” But for the likes of President Grant and his reformers, “the leading Mormons” were simply “criminals running at large, and were no more qualified to hold office than the [officers of the late Confederate] rebellion.” Since “Young and his Church controlled the territorial Legislature and Judges, it became necessary to substitute a United States judiciary for the territorial one.”

Ulysses S. Grant Joins the Great Game

With the driving of the Golden Spike at Promontory Point on May 10, 1869, Utah’s psychological and chronological distance from Eastern seats of power was dramatically reduced. Any number of troops could now be shipped by train into the Mormon Kingdom almost overnight to augment the permanent garrison ensconced at Camp Douglas overlooking Salt Lake City. Added to this, scarcely seventy days before the completion of the iron road in Utah, a man with an iron will, Ulysses S. Grant, had assumed the presidency of the United States. Having whipped Robert E. Lee and
his “Southern Rebels,” and now fully engaged in reconstruction, the hero of Appomattox began to turn his attention toward Brigham Young’s “Kingdom” with a mind to similarly whip the Mormon prophet in order to “reconstruct” theocratic Utah. Long before the election of President Grant, however, Young had taken steps to strengthen Mormon power in Southern Utah. Again and again he articulated his expectation that Utah’s Dixie and its adjacent Grand Canyon country would be the physical battlefield on which the fate of his kingdom would be decided should the United States and the Church actually come to blows. To Young, the red rocks on his southern border weren’t just beautiful, they were strategically vital and he believed God himself had created them for the salvation of the Saints. For one thing, Southern Utah was expansive, rough and rocky, and largely unexplored by “outsiders.” A collection of parched mountain deserts, there were few known water holes, and even fewer rivers and springs. Ravaged by millions of years of volcanic eruptions, earthquakes, and erosion, the area literally contained some of the roughest and most broken country on the planet. Speaking of the whole of Mormon Country, Young once said: “I could hide myself in these mountains, and defy five hundred thousand men to find me. That is not all, I could hide this whole people, and fifty times more, in the midst of these mountains, and our enemies might hunt until they died with old age, and they could not find us.”

Utah’s Dixie was settled and later strengthened with the specific purpose of providing the Saints with a sanctuary should the United States send troops against them. Within weeks of Grant’s inauguration in 1869, Young told Saints in Dixie: “If you want to know why we want to Settle this Southern Country[,] one reason is this. If the Nation Makes war upon us again we want some place to go whare [sic] we Can have a safe place to keep our women & Children in while we have to defend our homes.”

This was not mere rhetoric. For four years the Saints had watched from the safety of their mountain home as the armies of the Union and the Confederacy sought to destroy each other. It was a time of great violence in America that we can scarcely imagine even in our own violent times. Almost as soon as Generals Grant and Lee concluded the latter’s unconditional surrender in April 1865, powerful forces in the nation’s religious, political and military establishments turned jealous eyes toward the Mormon Kingdom in the West. Responding to angry constituents, officials throughout the country predicted that “within a year...there must be a collision of more or less importance between the church and the government.” During the summer of 1865 Speaker of the House Schuyler Colfax and powerful Chairman of the House Committee on Territories James M. Ashley
personally called on Brigham Young in Salt Lake City to issue on behalf of Congress stern new threats against Utah’s theocratic system. Ashley informed Young that now the Civil War had ended, the “religious element” that had orchestrated the successful crusade against southern slavery was now demanding that troops be sent to Utah to similarly abolish polygamy. He prophesied to the prophet that actual warfare “might come at any time” and that if it did, the result “would be terrible[!]” Hoping to intimidate Young, Colfax and Ashley explained that the troops they intended to send against him were the very soldiers that had “ravished every female & burnt every house” in a swath “50 miles wide” while humbling Georgia the previous summer. They boldly swore to Young’s face that if he continued to ignore the demands of the nation, Congress would direct General William Tecumseh Sherman to do the same to all Mormondom.  

Not a year later, Sherman himself, who by now had replaced Ulysses Grant as Major General of the entire U.S. Army, telegraphed Young that the country was full of “tried and experienced soldiers, who would be pleased...to avenge any wrongs” Young dared commit. Such threats increased until Grant’s inauguration in 1869, when it became clear that the new president intended to transform these threats into action.

Young was nowhere near as evenly matched with his opponents as were Russia and Britain in their “Great Game.” Of necessity, therefore, his strategy was almost exclusively defensive. It generally consisted of saber-rattling bluster followed by the feint and retreat and pretended exodus tactics characterized by the 1857–1858 Utah War and its “Move South.” By these “brilliant” means, even Gentiles agreed that “Brigham had got the best of [President James] Buchanan and won the game.” As Grant again began to mobilize national forces against him in the late 1860s, Young again contemplated putting his people “on wheels.” To the surprise of many modern Mormons, Young and his chief lieutenants seriously considered leaving northern Utah, if not the whole territory, “to the Devil.” In councils of war they actually debated the various merits of torching every house, store, mine and factory and deserting Utah as they had Ohio, Missouri, and Illinois. One thing they all agreed upon was that Brigham must not be surrendered to the authorities lest he be assassinated as Joseph Smith had been.

“The Great Mocking Mystery of Our Geography”

At the exact time that Young was contemplating another “move south,” Samuel Bowles III, editor-in-chief of a prominent Eastern newspaper, special friend of Vice President Colfax, and fellow plotter against Young and his Kingdom, highlighted a characteristic of the country on either side of the
Grand Canyon that made it of special importance to the church president. “Of all our grand continental area,” Bowles wrote in 1869, “the great mocking mystery of our geography is the Grand Canyon of the Colorado and the region of country along and around it.” He lamented that all the government maps in existence simply employed “a great blank to represent it.” “This vacant region,” he complained, “comprises the northern part of Arizona, and the southern part of Utah, and is three hundred miles from north to south and two hundred miles from east to west. Is any other nation so ignorant of such a [large] piece of itself?” And it was precisely this “vacant region” that Young chose as his “land of Canaan” refuge. As the winds of war set forth from Washington towards Utah in 1869, having such a piece of uncharted country at his back door was a godsend. With the exception of a few of his own scouts and lieutenants, Young himself happened to know about as much about this “blank space” on the government’s maps as any man living.

Not just happenstance, as Young prepared to move his cattle and perhaps even “church head quarters” into this exact region, Congress financed John Wesley Powell’s Colorado River Exploration Expedition of 1869 and followed it up with funding for subsequent mapping expeditions focused on the mysterious “vacant region” highlighted by Samuel Bowels. By 1874 Powell had thoroughly examined this “blank spot’s” geological features and produced a detailed map that the United States military could use to come after Brigham Young and other alleged “Mormon criminals” in their “New Canaan” refuge. It is a matter of great significance that the very first feature that Powell astronomically located and precisely plotted on his map was Pipe Springs Point — the exact location of Winsor Castle. Through the Powell Expedition, which because of its military significance was supplied by the War Department, at least by March 1871 when Powell made the unfinished castle his temporary headquarters, the Grant administration was made fully aware of Winsor Castle and the “New Canaan” refuge Young was creating on the Arizona Strip. Since it was part of an elaborate “game of bluff,” however, this was exactly what Young wanted and the reason he bent over backward to help the one-armed explorer. The connection of the Powell mapping expeditions to the Great Game has been virtually lost to history until now. But as 1869 turned into 1870, the exploring and plotting of what scholars call John Wesley Powell’s “great map” was still in the future.

Mormon Corridors

Building strings of fortified settlements on important roads had always been part of Brigham Young’s Great Game strategy. By 1870 he already controlled what scholars call “the Mormon Corridor,” a line of over twenty
fortified Latter-day Saint villages built on the most important road in Utah. Each town was not only ringed by a rock or adobe wall but also contained an actual fort in the center of town. Roughly following the route of the modern Interstate Highway known as I-15, in 1870 the Mormon Corridor stretched from Brigham City to St. George. (Interestingly, Young named the two major villages at either end of this strategic road for himself and his chief lieutenant in the work of Mormon colonization, his counsellor in the First Presidency, George A. Smith.)

According to the Prophet, the primary purpose of the walled towns and forts on his “belt of settlements” was not to protect the Saints and their livestock from Indians, but from “white devils from the States.” One of the purposes of Young’s fortified highway was to provide an escape route to the south on which the Saints could fall back, village by village, in a controlled and militarily protected exodus, should the Great Game escalate into actual warfare. Each Mormon community on the route was a well built redoubt where Young’s Mormon army, the Nauvoo Legion, could hold back invaders while others escorted women, children, livestock and other property to the safety of the next fortified town, and if necessary to a whole new place of refuge. Young had launched his people’s original exodus from Nauvoo into the snows of February 1846 on hearing that federal troops intended blocking their escape from the United States. Ever after, having an escape route was vital to his Great Game master plan. Originally, Young’s main corridor extended from Brigham City, Utah to San Bernardino, California, via St. George and Las Vegas, but with the establishment of the powerful anti-Mormon states of California and Nevada respectively in 1850 and 1864, escape to the southwest was no longer a viable option.

With Grant and his Congress threatening to bring 40,000 troops into Utah in 1870, Young determined it was high time to extend his fortified road into Arizona and beyond. As with earlier corridors the prophet designed, he directed that his new road be protected by “a line of settlements [extending from St. George] to Mexico.” Although Young would die before his “line of Settlements” actually reached Mexico, his southern corridor would later be called “the Honey Moon Trail.” Until the Mesa Arizona Temple was completed in 1927, Mormon faithful from a string of colonies in Arizona and Mexico would use it to come to Utah to be married in the St. George Temple. Once married, their return trip constituted their honeymoon. It is significant to re-emphasize in its Great Game context, however, that when it was first designed, the old Pipe Springs Road towards Mexico was a strategic route of exodus. In a time of extreme crisis it was a necessary escape route built to allow Brigham Young and other polygamists to retreat from Utah and perhaps even from the United States forever. Though the crisis that called for Young’s
great fortified corridor into Mexico would pass, it has left an indelible imprint on Mormon history. 52

The Pipe Springs Corridor

The first leg of Young’s fortified road to Mexico headed east from St. George toward a pair of Colorado River fords located above the Grand Canyon that Indians had used for millennia. The trails linked together clusters of Ancient Puebloan ruins scattered from Pipe Springs to the mouth of the Paria. At Kanab, for example, when Young charted this portion of his southern corridor in 1870, the remains of an Anasazi apartment complex which once stood three stories high and housed more than 200 people was still to be seen. 53 The Escalante-Domingues expedition of 1876 had followed some of these very trails and visited the fords as had untold numbers of Spanish and Mexican slavers from New Mexico making raids on the Indians of Utah. This system of ancient Indian trails moved across what Young and his contemporaries called “the Pipe Springs Plateau,” “the Pipe Springs Desert,” “the Land of Canaan,” or simply “the Kanab Country.” Mormons had been using these trails at least since 1858 when Young sent explorers to find a potential escape route for “Mormon criminals” in the wake of the Mountain Meadows Massacre and the Utah War. That year Jacob Hamblin and a dozen others had been sent to locate the crossings, make friends with the Hopis and Navajos, and to follow reports of child survivors of the Mountain Meadows Massacre being held by the Hopis. In the early 1860s adventurous herders such as Samuel Gould, William B. Maxwell, Peter Shirts, and Levi Savage used these trails to move animals onto the plateau. From 1866 onward, scores of Nauvoo Legion sorties chasing Indians traversed these trails. Already by 1870 this well-traveled corridor was beginning to be called “the old Pipe Springs Road.” Following various spurs, it climbed the precipitous Hurricane Fault, skirted the Vermilion Cliffs, and proceeded east to Kanab. Of necessity it made of use of important seeps and water holes at Gould’s Ranch, Tenney’s Springs, Short Creek, Pipe Springs, Kanab Creek, and the Paria River as it headed toward the Colorado Crossings. The ancient trails that the Mormons transformed into the Pipe Springs Corridor eventually determined the basic path of the highways that automobiles traverse today as they make their way between Hurricane and Lee’s Ferry at speeds the pioneers, not to mention the Ancient Puebloans, could hardly imagine. 54

By 1870 Brigham Young and his scouts only knew of a handful of places to cross the Colorado in the “blank spot” on Bowles’ government maps. The most placid fords were near the confluence of the Virgin and the
Colorado just beyond the western edge of the Grand Canyon. In an effort to hold these western fords and to develop a protected corridor leading to them, in 1865 Young had directed the building of a “line of settlements” on the Muddy River, a tributary to the Virgin. For a number of reasons, however, by 1871 Young had abandoned this corridor. The only other Colorado crossings available were located far to the east on the Pipe Springs Road beyond the head of the Grand Canyon. Separated only by about thirty miles of river, the first was “The Crossing of the Fathers,” then commonly known among the Mormons as “Ute Ford.” The second was “the Crossing of the Pariah” soon to be renamed “Lee’s Ferry.” Building and controlling a major wagon road to these crossings was a fundamental component of Young’s Great Game strategy. Not only was an actual escape route into Arizona and Mexico critical for Young, but its mere existence would enable him to use the threat of another mass Mormon exodus as a political tool.

The unique geographic features of Pipe Springs as well as its abundant and dependable supply of grass and water made this obscure spot in the desert the very key to Young’s Great Game strategy in the early 1870s. Along with everything else already discussed, it was simply impossible for an army to travel this desert corridor with animals and supply wagons without having to stop at the Springs to refill water barrels. Just as importantly, a geographic choke point caused by an extrusion of the Vermilion Cliffs known as Pipe Springs Point, and an impassable tributary of the Grand Canyon known as “Bull Rush Wash,” forced all travelers with stock and wagons to pass within canon fire of the Springs even if they dared risk passing without water. Young’s strategic mind quickly saw that if even a small fortress were constructed to control both the water and the pass, a relatively small retinue of men could control the whole Pipe Springs Road and access to its fords. Should Federal troops obtain this strategic point, they could hem Young and his polygamists in and his theocratic rule would be finished. No wonder he named his fort “Windsor Castle.” Securing control of Pipe Springs was vital, and while Mormons had taken possession of it as early as 1863, Navajo raids had caused the Springs and the whole Short Creek, Kanab and Long Valley region to be evacuated in 1866. Immediately following Grant’s inauguration in 1869, however, Young sent Jacob Hamblin to hold Pipe Springs by making an Indian farm there for Kaibab Paiutes. True to his general “line of settlement” policy, “the Indian settlement” at Pipe Springs was designed to be “a frontier protection to St. George.” Significantly, this was the first step in the three-decades long process of making a reservation for the Kaibab Band of Paiute Indians. In 1869, however, Hamblin’s Indian farm at Pipe Springs was purely strategic
and Young sent the missionary twenty Ballard rifles to help his Indians hold the pass and its water in behalf of the Latter-day Saints.  

“The Great Game Heats Up”

While the Cullom bill was debated in Congress in the early months of 1870, President Grant sent a tough new “reconstruction war governor” to Utah. Governor J. Wilson Shaffer was a “tough as nails” former Civil War general under orders to beard the Lion of the Lord for his president. Since the 1858 arrival of Alfred Cumming to “replace” Brigham Young as governor at the time of the Utah War, it was understood by all that Utah’s federally appointed governors were powerless figureheads in a territory dominated by the Mormon priesthood. In exasperation, Eastern papers reported that “Brigham Young has always claimed that he was the real Governor of Utah, and sworn by the Most High that he would be Governor of the Territory for ever and ever — informing the Gentiles that if they did not like this they might ‘leave and go to hell.’” 

Just months before Shaffer’s arrival, Young had boasted to the chairman of the Senate Judiciary Committee that these feckless federal appointees were “simply Governor[s] of the Territory, while I…am [still] Governor of the people.” One federally-appointed governor after another had been embarrassed and marginalized as “President Young” demonstrated that the Kingdom of God held the scepter in Utah. But Shaffer, backed by a powerful military-minded national executive, boldly proclaimed: “Never after me, by God, shall it be said that Brigham Young is Governor of Utah!”

About the time Governor Shaffer arrived in Utah, Ulysses Grant appointed Judge James B. McKean as Chief Justice of the Supreme Court of the Territory of Utah. The Eastern press portrayed McKean a fire-eating Methodist Missionary appointed on the recommendation of President Grant’s personal minister and religious advisor, the Right Reverend John P. Newman. McKean himself openly averred that his war with Mormonism was as much religious as it was political. Meanwhile, the papers described him as being “a wilder fanatic than Orson Pratt or John Taylor,” while Apostle George Q. Cannon described him as “the most unrelenting, persevering, and active enemy that I ever knew.” Acting as though the defeated Cullom bill had become law, Chief Justice McKean seized control of and dismantled the Mormon dominated Utah court system. With the backing of the President and the Governor, he developed a new Federal system in which he hoped Young could be tried and convicted for polygamy and murder. He carefully reconstructed Utah’s judicial statues to exclude believing Mormons from the
jury box. Assuming “the defendant was guilty [months] before [the] trial,” the Chief Justice and the head of the Salt Lake Office of the Associated Press deftly colored newspaper reports coming out of Utah to build support for his “pre-trial verdict” throughout the nation. One of Young’s non-Mormon attorneys, Thomas Fitch, complained that McKean and his helpers “tried their cases on the streets, in the newspapers, at public meetings, by petitions, and over the telegraph wires” and determined a verdict and sentence in the court of public opinion long before they entered the actual court room where the “rules of law” and “the wisdom of ages” had prescribed” that “the voice of passion and public clamor [should not] enter.”

Decrying McKean’s actions as unconstitutional, for months Young fostered the impression that his people would respond with armed resistance should the chief justice follow through with his plans to convict the prophet. The church controlled Nauvoo Legion of some 13,000 men was put on high alert and mustered and paraded in public displays of symbolic and literal “saber rattling.” Again and again Young’s agents told Eastern newspaper correspondents that the Prophet intended using his military to protect himself from prosecution even if U.S. troops were sent against him. Meanwhile, church members openly let it be known that they were “arming and equipping themselves” for battle “on a large scale.” Papers throughout the country reported that Brigham Young “will call upon each individual male Mormon to fight for his wives,” and that “being, as the Mohometans are, polygamists, the Mormons will fight like Turks.”

In classic Great Game responses to such reports, some of these papers called Young’s bluff. One of the chief anti-Mormon papers in Utah, the Daily Corrine Reporter, called Young’s “deep threats of resistance if the laws are to be enforced,” the same “old brag trick” the Prophet had used during the Utah War. “If Mormonism mean[s] war,” the Reporter bellowed, “it can and will have it; and in the end, if the Church be able to conquer the American people, then the world can cry out, saying ‘great is Allah! and Brigham is his prophet.’” The Reporter met Young’s “brag trick” tit for tat with its own bluster: “Let the call to arms resound through the valleys of the mountains, and the Saints of Zion attempt to do what they have promised; …in the meantime the courts and their juries [will] go on as though the invincible legions of Nauvoo were not ready to wipe us out, horse[,] foot and dragoons. A dash of war, however, like [Sherman’s] March to the Sea, would be rare sport for the sacred blockheads of Utah, who are [so] sure of victory.” Concerning Young’s claims that he intended to mobilize his legions, the Vermont Chronicle flatly stated:
We believe no such thing. Brigham Young is too shrewd to venture upon any such suicidal course. He knows too well the folly of attempting serious rebellion against the United States. Earnest work, on the part of the government, will put to flight the whole rabble of his followers.

“Bull” is the only game by which he can succeed, and this he will use, with all guile and energy. If he can frighten the national officers with huge bugbears, and tickle demagogues with sugar plums, he will be sure to keep up a brazen front, ... 

“Far Beyond Anything Else in the Whole Country”

It was in this climate that Brigham Young selected his New Canaan retreat and proposed building a fort in the Pipe Springs desert. Prime evidence that the fort was more part of a bluff in a propaganda campaign designed to “keep up a brazen front” than an actual preparation for war, when Young personally staked out the footings for the new structure he made sure that representatives of the government were there to witness it. Major John Wesley Powell of the Army Corp of Engineers was in the region in the first place preparing to map the “vacant region” on government maps along the Utah-Arizona border that Young had openly forecast would likely be part of the expected showdown between himself and Ulysses Grant. Were Young actually planning on fighting he would certainly have chased Powell and his associates out of the area. Instead he escorted them to Pipe Springs and gave them front row seats at the fort’s ground breaking ceremonies. They were also allowed to witness religious rites recommencing a fortified outpost at Kanab. Meanwhile, the Prophet directed his chief scout, Jacob Hamblin (the white man who knew this “blank region” best), to help Powell make peace with the Indians and commence his mapping. Obviously not meant to be a well kept tactical secret, but rather a Great Game “bugbear,” Young internationally published his activities, making sure the world knew that his desert fort at Pipe Springs would “enclose a fine spring of good water,” and that he provocatively proposed naming it “Windsor Castle.”

Not the only player in the Great Game, however, even as Young traveled back to Salt Lake City from Pipe Springs, President Grant made a startling move of his own by directing Governor Shaffer to issue a pair of proclamations which in effect dismantled the Nauvoo Legion, a church army 13,000 men strong that up to this point had been the ultimate expression of Young’s power. With his knights and bishops ostensibly toppled, it was “check,” but not quite “checkmate.” Young did his best to ignore Shaffer’s
proclamations officially disbanding his legions and responded by aggressively pushing his agents to expedite the construction of his castle. 67

Undoubtedly part of a calculated effort to impress Grant with his preparations for war, in March 1871 Young encouraged Powell and his survey team to use the construction site at Pipe Springs as a base of operations. Survey member Frederick Dellenbaugh later wrote a description of this visit that gives some insight into the fort’s Great Game significance:

At two o’clock we came to Pipe Springs. A vacant stone house of one very large room and a great fireplace was put at our disposal by Mr. Winsor the proprietor. …For protection against raiders Mr. Winsor was building a solid double house of blocks of sandstone, making walls three feet thick. The two buildings were placed about twenty feet apart, thus forming an interior court the length of the houses, protected at the ends by high walls and heavy gates. No windows opened on the exterior, but there were plenty of loopholes commanding every approach. A fine large spring was conducted subterraneously into the corner of one of the buildings and out again, insuring plenty of water in case of a siege. Brigham Young was part owner of this establishment, and it was one of the most effective places of defence [sic] on a small scale, that I have ever seen. It was never needed so far as I have heard, and even at the time I marvelled [sic] that it should be so elaborately prepared — far beyond anything else in the whole country. 68

Largely a result of Powell’s connections with a host of “Salt Lake correspondents” of Eastern papers, and the fact that most of his men were “Utah correspondents” themselves, by March 1871 the national press reported that “it is rumored that Brigham Young is going to transfer Church headquarters to Kanab, an almost inaccessible settlement in the mountains of southeastern Utah, about which Brigham has been fussing and fluttering for a year past.” Most concluded, however, that it was more likely that this area on the Utah-Arizona border about which Young had been “fussing and fluttering” was “designed as a retreat for Mormon criminals in case of troublesome grand juries and courts, as he and his set are too well fixed where they are to voluntarily tramp further into the wilderness again in their old age.” Some of them mocked that “whether the wicked will cease from troubling [Young and his criminals], even in Kanab, remains to be proved.” 69

“Brigham Young has played his game of bluff long enough. I will make him show his hand.”

When Governor Shaffer issued his proclamations on 15 September 1870, the Mormon army that had held Buchanan’s troops at bay during the Utah
War was destroyed as far as the law was concerned. If Young now actually used the outlawed force, he would bring down the wrath of the nation upon him in the form of United States troops. “Brigham Young has played his game of bluff long enough,” Grant’s war governor openly challenged, “I will make him show his hand.” 70 To the joy of the Latter-day Saints, Shaffer died scarcely a fortnight after issuing his proclamations. Since Grant, his Secretary of War, and their generals were the true masterminds of Shaffer’s policy, however, the proclamations remained firmly in force. Convinced the future of Mormonism rose or fell with the Nauvoo Legion, Young tested Grant’s resolve to enforce the proclamations a number of times. One of these episodes was perhaps the most precipitous and dangerous feint in Young’s entire Great Game career. Symbolically, he timed his rash thrust with the “Independence Day” parade in Salt Lake City on the Fourth of July 1871, a time when he conveniently would be “out of town” — but not far from his telegraph line. On 22 June, Young’s counselor in the First Presidency, Daniel H. Wells, acted in his outlawed position of lieutenant-general of the Nauvoo Legion and ordered the commandant of the Legion’s Salt Lake Military District to furnish the city’s upcoming Independence Day parade with several brigades of Mormon troops. The requisition included several military bands, five units of infantry and cavalry, and a company of artillery whose caparisoned horses were to drag heavy wheeled cannons “to fire salutes, etc.”

On 30 June, Acting Governor George A. Black issued a third proclamation reinforcing Shaffer’s orders and forbidding the militia to march in the parade. In consultation with President Grant and the War Department, Black publicly ordered General Régis de Trobriand, commandant of the United States troops at Camp Douglas, to post three companies of his best men, backed by heavy artillery, on the streets of the city to enforce all three gubernatorial proclamations. Meanwhile, additional U.S. troops poured into Salt Lake City by train. Young shrewdly, and dangerously, used the celebration of “the 95th anniversary of our Nation’s Independence” to make the Saints look like patriotic victims simply trying to celebrate the basic American rights some of their fathers had died for. As the date of the national celebration approached, Young and Unconditional Surrender Grant stared each other down. On the morning of the Fourth, five companies of Nauvoo Legion infantrymen and cavalry lined up fully armed and uniformed accompanied by the requested martial bands and heavy artillery. At some point down the pre-determined parade route General de Trobriand posted three companies of U.S. troops with artillery of his own. A friend of
the Mormons, but withal an obedient soldier, de Trobriand, let it be known that he had orders to destroy the Mormon soldiers should they march down the parade route and that he was prepared to do it! This was the Great Game at its best — or, more correctly, at its very worst. As reckless a game of chicken as Young ever participated in, the parade came surprisingly close to deluging the streets of Salt Lake City in blood. General de Trobriand’s daughter later penned an account of the event from her father’s point of view. Knowing his orders and determination to obey them, she asked the question which must have been on every mind that morning: “was [that Independence Day] sun rising on the first day of a second civil war, small in proportion to the last one, to be sure, but not to be closed without its record of bloodshed?”

In keeping with his character, style, and lifelong bluff, feint and retreat strategy (not to mention the smaller size of the forces behind him), it is not surprising that Brigham Young was the first to blink. The ultimate peaceful resolution to his staged bluff, at the last possible moment Young substituted his Nauvoo Legion troops with 300 prepubescent Mormon girls wearing pure white dresses, carrying flowers, and bearing banners appropriate for the day touting “Liberty,” “Freedom,” “The Constitution,” and “President Grant,” that considering the circumstances were meant to be sarcastic. 71 In Salt Lake City “to see how the glorious Fourth was celebrated in Mormondom,” Women’s Rights leaders Elizabeth Cady Stanton and Susan B. Anthony were undoubtedly mortified to see how these beautifully dressed little girls became pawns, mixing on a potential battlefield with knights, bishops and kings, in this great national game of chess. 72 But the event passed without a drop of blood being shed.

“Federal Authority vs. Polygamic Theocracy: A System is on Trial in the Person of Brigham Young.”

While the long term pageantry of the emasculation of the Nauvoo Legion was unfolding, Chief Justice McKean was finalizing his Anti-Mormon controlled legal system which even the Gentile territorial prosecuting attorney acknowledged was utterly corrupt and illegal, designed as it was “to consummate the judicial murder of Brigham Young, Mayor Wells, …and other leading Mormons, on charges the most absurd and untrue.” 73 McKean’s plan involved twisting statutes passed by the Mormon controlled legislature against adultery to apply to plural marriage. Similarly, he planned to use alleged Utah War crimes (that had been pardoned by President James
Buchanan) to indict Young and other church leaders not only for adultery but also for murder. There was an immediate outcry in Utah, throughout the nation, and even in Congress that McKean’s proceedings were unconstitutional. With his president squarely behind him, and indeed, calling the shots, McKean simply moved forward. When Mormon authorities learned that the adultery indictments were about to be served on Brigham Young in late September 1871, civil war again nearly erupted in northern Utah. Trainloads of U.S. troops were again shipped to Salt Lake to help their brothers at Camp Douglas see that Young and other “adulterers” could be peacefully arrested and taken into custody.

On the eve of his arrest (October 1, 1871), Young held a council of the First Presidency, the Twelve Apostles, and other key advisors including a number of high-powered non-Mormon attorneys to determine a course of action. Undoubtedly directed by their client, the lawyers divulged the council’s proceedings to the national press for Great Game effect. “Baked dry in the furnace of old Mormon dangers,” their report ran, the old polygamous patriarchs “almost unanimously” resolved that the Prophet “must never give himself up” to the federal courts. They prophesied that “if he were to be convicted” the whole church would rise in violence against the Gentiles “whether [the Prophet] forbade them or no.” Their counsel was for the whole community “to cut the irrigating ditches, burn every Mormon settlement in the Territory, leave [it] in desolation, and march across Arizona with their herds and portables to Mexican soil.” Their improvements in Utah “were their own,” they argued, “and they had a right to annihilate [their] property” as they left, lest it fall into the hands of their “enemies.” By now, Young was seventy years old. He was sick and enfeebled by constant stress. By all accounts at this moment he was a worn out “old lion.” After hearing his brethren’s counsel, Young reportedly “closed his great square mouth and jaw, and said calmly: ‘God is in courts as well as in battles and marches. There will be no resistance. I shall obey the summons.’”

The very next day the Prophet submitted to arrest on charges of “lewd and lascivious cohabitation with sixteen different women.” Waiting to see what the Mormon populace would do, McKean wisely withheld the murder indictments for a time. Part of a pre-determined arrangement between the church president’s attorneys and the Chief Justice, Young was released on $5,000 bail so that he would not be held in the post jail at Camp Douglas where he was convinced he would be at the mercy of soldier assassins. As the proceedings progressed, Judge McKean directed his packed anti-Mormon jury not to regard the case as a simple adultery or polygamy case. He
brazenly harangued them before a room full of newspaper correspondents that “the case of the people vs. Brigham Young” should really be viewed as “Federal Authority vs. Polygamic Theocracy.” Even more to his point, he lectured the jury, “The Government of the United States, founded upon a written Constitution, finds within its jurisdiction another Government — claiming to come from God — imperium in imperio — whose policy and practices, are in grave particulars, at variance with its own. The one Government arrests the other in the person of its chief, and arraigns it at the bar.” McKean was thus illegally using a twisted adultery case to attempt to topple the whole Mormon theocracy. As he put it, an entire “system is on trial in the person of BRIGHAM YOUNG.” To the consternation of the national conscience, however, Young’s alleged adulteries had nothing to do with his theocratic government. Not only that, contrary to the principles of accepted jurisprudence, the judge had already determined the defendant’s guilt before the evidence was adduced. 76

Grant’s political enemies immediately pounced on this “judicial abuse” and made the most of it in the press. Seeing an opportunity to change public opinion, Young dispatched Utah’s lone delegate to Congress, William H. Hooper, to Washington and Apostle George Q. Cannon to San Francisco. Their mission was to foment opposition against McKean’s policy with capitalists, congressmen, and journalists and thereby “mollify the demands of the nation, and suffer [the Saints] to retain their religion and their country intact.” Their hope was that with the support of powerful Gentile “friends” they might effect some kind of a compromise with the Grant administration. To raise allies among important business interests in San Francisco, Cannon personally promised magnates there that if McKean’s prosecutions continued, “the Mormons will burn all they have and make another exodus, as they did from Illinois.” Despite newspaper prophecies of “a little civil war in Brigham Young’s domain,” Cannon freely told reporters that the Church had “no disposition to fight.” If Young were convicted by McKean, he said, the people of Utah would simply “destroy the country and leave it a desert [as they had found it] and get into the wilderness again.” In a Great Game move of his own, Hooper represented that he had “a proposition in his pocket to make to President Grant” promising that if the Civil War hero would call off his crusade and allow Utah into the Union, the Mormons would abolish polygamy. Hooper assured all he spoke with that the rising generation in Utah was “against polygamy” anyway, and that “the institution would die of its own accord if left alone.” 77 But the president was not called “Unconditional Surrender Grant” for nothing. For him theocracy was the real issue and not polygamy. Meanwhile, Young needed time for
this growing groundswell against Grant’s Utah policy to develop. With
national newspapers and important Washington politicians beginning to
condemn his actions, McKean too knew that time was of the essence. He
therefore hurried to have the murder warrants against Young and other
church leaders served. 78

Brigham Young’s Final Exodus

Learning that “indictments for murder” were about to be served on
Presidents Young and Wells, and fully convinced that McKean meant to
bring about Young’s conviction and the toppling of his theocracy by “packed
juries and federal bayonets,” the Prophet and his attorneys now felt that his
life was in immediate danger. As a result, on 24 October, Young “secretly
and in the night” fled to St. George before McKean’s murder warrants
could be served. To discourage a posse of U.S. troops from following, it
was leaked to the Press that the fleeing leader was attended by 100 heavily
armed Nauvoo Legion riders and that he reviewed a military muster of 500
Mormon troops in Provo. It was also understood that he could mobilize
armed Saints from any number of settlements on the corridor he travelled.
Great Game rumors were also sent flying that he was leaving the oppres-
sion of Utah’s federal courts forever, that he traveled only at night, and that
his destination was either Mexico or “the southern extremity of Arizona.” 79
Lurid reports abounded across the board. The Baltimore Sun, for exam-
ple, broke the story that Young was about to initiate “a plan of retaliation
[against] the United States for the course pursued against him” by inciting
“an Indian war from Arizona to the northern bounds of Dakota.” A “sen-
sational dispatch” from Washington, D.C. reported that Young had directed
Native American allies to “destroy the overland railroads and devastate the
whole western frontier.” 80

The press related that the whole Mormon Church was “in the greatest
ferment” as its leaders were “all slipping off secretly and without the knowl-
edge of the people.” With the absconded prophet saying nothing to his
church or the nation, one Eastern paper captured the spirit of the times by
reporting that “something mysterious is in the wind, and an ominous silence
reigns in Mormon quarters.” 81 But salacious rumors continued to fill this
void. Apostle Joseph F. Smith wrote his fellow apostle, John Henry Smith,

there never was a time when rumor was more busy, especially for a
few days after the Prest. left. The very air seemed to be filled with all
sorts of wonderful reports, and rumors....We have survived all sorts
of rumors about ‘Deputy Marshels’ [sic] and ‘possees’ going after the
President, [and] today it is [even] rumored that he has been arrested. I trust that this, as all its predecessors so far have, will prove false.

It is clear that even these high ranking Church officials did not now fully know their president’s mind. Would he direct them to resist arrest by force of arms? Would orders be given for the wholesale evacuation of Utah? Joseph F. told John Henry that he had carefully examined his own weapons and “pronounced them in readiness and in good condition.” He reported that he had “five pieces and 550 rounds,” but hoped to “double” that quantity soon. “Whatever may happen,” he confessed, “I have never been able to see, in my mind’s eye, the hegira of Gods people from this city, nor from these valleys, as yet.” This notwithstanding, rank and file Mormons interviewed on the streets of Salt Lake City told newspaper correspondents from all over the country that they and their children were prepared to “torch” their dwellings “and burn down everything, if circumstances demand it!” As usual Young was keeping his options open. But he promised to make his mind known to his lieutenants as the way became clear, for as he made his way south, he communicated to President Wells: “We shall want an opperator [sic] in my [Salt Lake] Telegraph Office so that we can hold our conversation each and every night.”

As it turned out, Brigham’s last flight was a master stroke of Great Game genius and soon played a dramatic role in changing public opinion in his favor. At first a trickle of newspaper articles began to represent him as a worn out old man being driven into the wilderness by state sponsored “religious persecution.” The question was asked, “If the Mormons are persecuted by the Government, who’s church is next?” Other papers thought Young’s “flight” gave credit to rumors that “the Mormons intend to go to Mexico, where they have been offered shelter from persecuting monogamists,” and “to the later rumor that Brigham goes now as the new Moses leading his people into a promise[d] land beyond the confines of this Republic.” Was the Prophet’s flight the signal that the promised mass exodus and its “scorched earth devastation” was about to begin? Would the departing Mormons actually destroy the transcontinental railroad as they had promised? If so it would have catastrophic consequences for the entire U.S. economy. Utah’s “half way house” not only made it possible for the wealth of the pacific coast to be brought to Eastern cities, but it’s desert agriculture helped sustain the lucrative mines of Nevada, Montana, Colorado, Idaho and Utah.

A growing chorus of newspaper editors asked their readers, “Who can replace the Mormons? …What elements of population will take this
soil and conduct agriculture [in Utah] if the Mormons should abandon it?” They argued that “between the drought, grasshoppers, alkali, the need of perpetual cooperation to regulate the ditches, and the primitive poverty of the ground, Mormon frugality and unity only [could] sustain the miracle of this garden in the desert” called Utah. One newspaperman editorialized: “There are not five Gentile farmers in Utah. An exodus to Mexico, with their abundance of fine heads of cattle, sheep and horses, might give Mormonism a better empire, but what race would revive this one?” The papers reported that “since the present persecutions began,” a “general disquietude and reluctance on the part of capitalists to invest in the development of [Utah’s] mines,” had diverted “not less than nine millions of dollars” from Utah’s mines which were judged “to be unequalled on the continent in wealth and permanence.” They argued that Mormon Utah had become a “national necessity” and that the United States itself would be “the principal loser” if McKean’s “persecutions” were allowed to continue. Soon the trickle of articles calling Grant off his crusade became a flood. Worried capitalists now pulled the strings of the senators and congressmen their campaign contributions had purchased. At once a growing chorus of politicians charged that in their attempt to “Reconstruct Utah,” Grant and McKean had egregiously abused the Constitution.

A lull in McKean’s prosecutions caused by Young’s flight gave the Prophet and his agents precious time to exploit this growing national discontent and they made the most of the opportunity. Young sent one of his high-paid Gentile attorneys, a former member of Congress named Thomas Fitch, “as a Mormon missionary” to the east coast to lecture on the Saints’ “side of the story.” He delivered a “sermon” in Congress highlighting the potential cost of “a long Mormon war” and delineating its “consequences to the nation.” Influential papers like the New York Herald published lengthy columns on Fitch’s views which further educated the public that President Grant, through McKean’s rulings, had “passed the Cullom bill” though Congress had not. Fitch represented McKean as “a sort of missionary exercising judicial functions” and made sure the whole nation knew of his handpicked his juries, his determination of guilt before the hearing of evidence, and the manner in which he had twisted territorial statutes against adultery to fit polygamy. With Fitch’s careful guidance, the papers helped the public understand that McKean was illegally using alleged “Utah War crimes” that President Buchanan had pardoned long ago to charge the Prophet with
murder. He also explained that Young had been forced to flee Salt Lake City because he had “no chance” for a fair trial. 89

Meanwhile, Young hired prominent newspapermen to help sway public opinion. One of them was an acclaimed former Civil War journalist named George Alfred Townsend who published his newspaper attacks against Grant and McKean in a forty-nine paged pamphlet called The Mormon Trials which was distributed nationally. Townsend represented McKean as a Methodist preacher on a sectarian “crusade against polygamy.” He charged that McKean’s behavior on the bench had been “despotic and extra-judicial to the last degree,” and that his zeal for his own religion caused him to “resolve in advance that everybody is guilty who can keep awake under Orson Pratt’s sermons.” The gist of The Mormon Trials was that Grant, McKean, and secret cabal of phony “reconstructionists” were all part of national conspiracy designed to drive the Mormons out of the richest territory in the Union so that they could “rob and plunder” their property. In a particularly poignant part of his publication, Townsend quoted Daniel H. Wells as saying, “Our greatest crime is that we have received a beautiful country from the Almighty, and you want it.” 90 Despite the fact that the Salt Lake Tribune condemned “the advocacy of such [hirelings] as Fitch and Townsend,” they expected that the Prophet would get his money’s worth out of their services — and he certainly did. 91

In a political tsunami Young had worked long and hard to create, the tide had turned decidedly against Grant’s tool, Chief Justice McKean, and by association, against his master. The Sacramento Reporter, captured the spirit of the changing national consensus when it editorialized:

To us it appears that the honor and dignity of the Federal Government have been dragged into the dirt by Judge McKean,...It was the duty of the Government to attack polygamy, but it should have been done in a manly and equitable fashion. [McKean’s] pettifogging way of splitting straws...is more befitting some little shyster-ridden Justice’s Court, than the great machinery of the Federal Government, and we, speaking in behalf of every clear-sighted and honest man in the country, denounce and reprove it as an insult and a reproach to the American people. 92

With a deluge of newspaper articles all over the country now demanding that “mercy” and “humanity” be extended to the Mormons, serious dissensions arose in Grant’s cabinet. Within a few weeks of “the old Lion’s” exodus into the desert, national headlines were reading: “Frauds and Folly of Federal Interference in Utah,” “The Administration Weakening on the Polygamy Question,” “Republicans Becoming More Lenient Towards the
Saints,” “A Compromise [with Utah now] Possible,” and “A Gleam of Hope for Brigham Young.” A month after Young left northern Utah, even his enemies at the *Salt Lake Tribune* were forced to acknowledge that “with the flight of the Prophet passed away for ever all prospects of another Mormon war or [of] another exodus.” The *Tribune* reluctantly observed that “it cannot be truthfully denied that a substantial portion of the American press have come ‘to the rescue’ of the Mormons.”

In his State of the Union address on 4 December, President Grant attempted to defend himself and his tools in Utah by declaring that their fight was “not with the religion of the self-styled Saints” but “with their practices.” Reacting to public pressure, the President reluctantly promised the nation that the Mormons would “be protected in the worship of God according to the dictates of their consciences.” But he also made it clear that “they [would] not be permitted to violate the laws [of the land] under the cloak of religion.” There were aspects of the Saints’ religion, he reminded the nation, that were “repugnant to civilization, to decency, and to the laws of the United States.” Despite the controversy over Utah’s chief justice, the President made it clear that he still stood behind McKean and the territory’s other federal officials and he commended their diligence in “sustaining the majesty of the law.” Despite the president’s tough talk, however, Young’s successful propaganda campaign made it impossible for him to enforce his stated determination to see that “neither polygamy or any other violation of existing statutes” would be be permitted in Utah. Latter-day Saint Polygamy, therefore, would not be conquered for another generation.

“Brigham Young has left Utah and gone to the ‘Springs’”

While the words “Pipe Springs,” or “Winsor Castle” have not been found quite this early in the correspondence between Grant, his governors, judges, and military officers, the names “Kanab” and “the Kanab Country” do frequently appear. It will be remembered that Kanab is only fifteen miles from Pipe Springs as the crow flies. But as the Prophet disappeared into the south, a hand full of newspapers reported that “Brigham Young has left Utah and gone to the ‘Springs’.” Though the word “Pipe” was missing, there was only one refuge in the region the phrase “the ‘Springs’” could refer to. “The Springs,” and nearby Kanab were at the heart of “the almost inaccessible” desert bastion “about which Brigham [had] been fluttering and puttering for about a year.” This was the center of his “New Canaan” refuge and the battlefield he wanted John Wesley Powell to map for Washington as part of his Great Game strategy. And this was the home
of the “most effective place of defense” with its “elaborately prepared” fortress “far beyond anything else in the whole country” that caused Powell’s men to “marvel.”

The day Young was arrested for “lewd and lascivious cohabitation” (2 October 1871), three weeks before he actually absconded, George L. Woods, Grant’s replacement for the deceased war governor Shaffer, wrote his president:

*The Mormons are all powerful in [the southern] portion of the Territory, there being but few “Gentile” miners down there, and the whole power of the church is used to secrete persons charged with crime. Kanab, a remote settlement in the extreme south, exclusively Mormon, is a place of refuge; they are prepared for resistance there, and declare that no arrests shall be made. In that valley the most of the murderers of Mountain Meadows will take refuge, and it will be useless for the marshal, unattended with an efficient military force, to attempt to take any of them into custody.*

To get at the Kanab Country, Governor Woods called for the erection of a military post in St. George or Beaver. “I know troops are scarce,” he acknowledged to the president, “but there is perhaps no place in the Republic where they are more needed than [there].” Aware that a post in southern Utah would take time to establish, he called for “at least one hundred [U.S. cavalrymen] to go to Beaver in the latter part of December to assist the civil authorities in the execution of [McKean’s] laws.”

With the Deseret Telegraph in place, and every Mormon a spy, Young knew he would have ample time to hide should troops come. “[I] expect not to be disturbed by Dept Marshals or anybody else,” he wrote President Wells, adding “They all well understand that my going south is to preserve their scalps and their heads for it has been about almost impossible to restrain the people from taking vengeance on them and they may attribute it to my good feelings and Kindness that they still live.” Arriving in St. George on 1 November, the Prophet wasted little time in conclusively demonstrating that he had no intention of a wholesale Latter-day Saint exodus from Utah by breaking ground for a new temple. The St. George Temple would, of course, be the first temple completed in Utah and was evidence enough, if indeed anybody needed it, that the Mormons were in Utah to stay. The town’s namesake, George A. Smith of the First Presidency, offered the dedicatory prayer on 9 November, specifically thanking the Lord “for this desert land,” and that the Saints were “permitted to shelter [them]selves [there] from the enemies of [His] Cause.” He begged the Lord
to preserve “His Servant Brigham...from his enemies,” specifically praying that God would “control the President of the United States, and those in authority, who purpose evil against thy people.” Smith pled with the God of Heaven to “put hooks in the jaws of the enemies of Zion, and turn them from their wicked purposes.” Even more evidence that Young was not actually planning to permanently leave at least Southern Utah, directly after Smith’s prayer, and before he moved the first shovel of earth for the Temple’s foundation, he looked at the desert country around him and then at the assembled crowd and said, “The idea may arise that this is a hard land in which to get a living. Now I am very thankful for the land just as it is. It is a splendid country to rear Saints in. Among our other duties we have to build a Temple here.” Certainly Young was not planning on going anywhere else, just yet.  

But showing an exodus for himself and other polygamists was still a potentiality, he dispatched Jacob Hamblin to enlist John D. Lee, then hiding from McKean in the Kanab area, to build a ferry at the Paria Crossing of the Colorado. The latter soon resorted hither and made a home at the crossing, thus giving his name to “Lee’s Ferry” for all time. Young’s personal destination was still in a state of flux, and depended on what was happening in Salt Lake City, or more correctly, in Washington. For Lee’s part, he simply reported that “Young was anxious to have the ferry kept in good condition for passing the river, for he did not know what hour he might need it.” 100 Similarly, Young put pressure on A. Milton Musser, Superintendent of the Deseret Telegraph Company, to have the Deseret Telegraph line extended from St. George to Pipe Springs and Kanab as quickly as possible, thus finalizing his preparations to be able to communicate with his entire kingdom from his desert retreat through his personal telegrapher who accompanied him. Erastus Snow noted the “great urgency” Musser exerted on behalf of his prophet’s needs to extend Dixie’s telegraph line to Pipe Springs. 101 Bringing the line through to Pipe Springs was part of a larger effort to connect every Mormon settlement to the Deseret Telegraph line in order to alert polygamists anywhere and everywhere to flee when federal officials came against them. The telegraph line would serve this very purpose for the next twenty years. 102 But connecting Pipe Springs to the line was then of signal importance as Governor Woods, Utah’s federal marshals and military officers, and in fact the whole leadership of the War Department and the president’s cabinet itself were still discussing the political implications of sending marshals and troops into “the Kanab Country” after Brigham Young. As they held these discussions, in November and December 1871, southern church members
worked feverishly to dig the holes, erect the poles and bring the line to Pipe Springs, and on 15 December 1871, the first telegraphic message was sent from Winsor Castle. 103

Leaving the completion of the line to the people, from 20 November to 9 December, Young spent most of his time “fluttering and puttering” around in the Pipe Springs Desert with a number of advisors. They straightened and shortened his exodus corridor, occasionally leaving it to take side trips to explore its rugged side canyons and washes, looking for “secure resting places” for polygamists. He examined the forts at Kanab and Pipe Springs, and at least on the 23rd and the 28th his entourage overnighted at the Castle with “Brother Winsor.” He found stone masons still at the Springs, frantically finishing the castle’s walls, and carpenters hanging its massive doors. He observed that the telegraph wire reached Pipe Springs on 25 November, but Musser did not get the telegraph instruments there and connect them until the middle of December. There may have been some sort of a celebration on 28 November, for the wife of Pipe Springs’ master mason, Elijah Averett, wrote that on Young’s last night there, former Danite Porter Rockwell, along as “a body guard to Brigham,” got “rather drunk, and as they left Pipe Brigham and the driver of the team were sitting in the front seat looking solemnly [sic] ahead” with Rockwell in back, wildly “shouting and waving his hat.” 104 On 11 December Young wrote his secretary in Salt Lake City that his health was improving and that “we are engaged…exploring…and seeking out and locating secure resting places for the Saints among the rugged recesses of these majestic mountains.” 105 Meanwhile, newspapers throughout the country were gaining at least some concept of Young’s Kanab-Pipe Springs hideout. They reported that Young had left St. George (and the jurisdiction of Chief Justice McKean) “to visit an outlying Mormon settlement in northern Arizona” but that he was still in touch with his telegraph line. McKean threatened to seize Young’s bail bond for leaving the jurisdiction of his court. 106

By 16 December, however, the national consensus had fully changed. Newspapers touted the possible impeachment of Ulysses Grant for a host of issues, including his war with the Mormons. They complained that “Grant was without political experience,” and that he had been “educated in the school of military and arbitrary power, and has assumed authority when not clearly granted, or not granted at all.” 107 With the cloud of the impeachment of Grant’s immediate predecessor, President Andrew Johnson, still hanging over the White House, powerful senators, congressmen and newspapermen assured the Saints “that none in Utah
dare to hurt them if the voice of the nation declares it must not be.” Since Young was not chased into the desert, nor had the troops in Salt Lake been unleashed on the city’s population, the papers assured the Mormons that they now had “immediately before them abundant evidence that the nation has the disposition to save, [and] not destroy them, yet desires to correct their faults.” The Mormons were exhorted to understand by this “something of American generosity and justice” and that they could now trust their national representatives to be fair. “Henceforth, it is peace and not war as far as [the great American public was] concerned.” The Senate Judiciary Committee promised to bring McKean’s illegal proceedings before the Supreme Court of the United States where the whole affair would certainly be quashed, but Young must return and fight his battles in the American way, that is, in court. Young’s attorneys advised him that McKean would take his case up again on 9 January 1872, and that he must be present or lose the newfound (but temporary) goodwill of the American people.

It seems Grant, McKean, and Young were all three driven into separate corners by the American people, who through their representatives now demanded that they each must change their Great Game tactics. On Sunday 16 December 1871, Brigham Young turned his back on Winsor Castle and all the rest of his southern preparations, and headed north to face Justice James B. McKean in court. On 9 January 1872 McKean was forced to show clemency and instead of the rowdy soldiers of Camp Douglas providing Young with “a comfortable cot and a tin plate,” (and perhaps even a hangman’s noose,) in their military jail, McKean was pressed by Eastern politics to allow the prophet to be held under house-arrest in his own home and office for nearly four months while his murder trial continued. Young was released on 25 April 1872 after the United States Supreme Court, in what is called the Englebrecht Decision, declared Justice McKean’s self-manufactured legal system unconstitutional. According to the Salt Lake Tribune, when it became known what direction the Supreme Court was to take, Unconditional Surrender Grant “bit off the end of his cigar” and declared that there no longer need be any “apprehension of a collision in Utah.” “It would be his business to preserve the peace there,” the old war hero vowed. But he could not pass up the opportunity for a last jab at the Mormon prophet by exulting that, despite this setback for his own game, Young’s “‘game of bluff’ with the United States closed with the completion of the railroad.” Grant, Young, and McKean would all go on, but they would each be different in the future.
The Great Game, Pipe Springs, and the Quintessential Mormon Corridor

The road back to Salt Lake City from St. George that December was rough, long, and stormy for the seventy-one year old Brigham. That bleak trail now seems an apt metaphor for the longer and rougher road the prophet would eventually die on — the road of Mormon peace with the American people. Of all the roads Young had led his people over, this was certainly the longest, the roughest, and the stormiest. And like all the others, this thoroughfare, beset as it was with numerous tight-spots, tough climbs, and rocky descents, would play its part in in the evolving identity of the Latter-day Saints as a people. It is this road that was, and still is, the quintessential “Mormon Corridor,” a passage through a string of bottlenecks, a line of settlements and experiences pioneering through time a Latter-Day Saint place inside a larger and stronger American, and now global, culture. Significantly, this Mormon Corridor also passed through the Pipe Springs bottleneck formed by the Vermilion Cliffs and the Grand Canyon’s Bull Rush Wash.

Just after crossing the rim of the Great Basin at Kanarraville on their northern journey, on 19 December 1871, a party was thrown by adoring locals for the President and his passing entourage. Knowing what the trip north could mean for all of them, Church member John D. Parker “wept like a child because Pres [sic] Young was going back to face his enemies in the court room.” Parker had served for a time as “the personal guard of Joseph Smith,” and dared his current prophet that he considered his decision to face McKean in court “an act of madness, as Pres. Grant had sworn to hang him and Judge McKean was his mortal enemy.” George A. Smith, who dictated an account of this poignant interchange to a scribe shortly after arriving in Salt Lake City, described that Parker’s feeling “was very general with all the people with whom the party conversed as they passed through the southern country.” Knowing that this phase of the Great Game was up, Young characteristically “told the people that God would overrule all for the best good of Zion.”

Young’s December 1871 trip north signaled a dramatic shift in his Great Game strategy. He would never again build forts against American forces or threaten to raise arms against U.S. troops. It is true there would be fortifications built to protect Mormons from Native Americans, and even from Mexicans, but never again would he raise them against the United States. It is in this sense that Winsor Castle at Pipe Springs was Brigham Young’s last bastion. It was designed and built during his last planned military conflict with the United States of America. The Nauvoo Legion was gone forever.
John Wesley Powell, soon to be joined by George M. Wheeler, Clarence King, Clarence Dutton, Ferdinand Hayden and their expeditions, would map every hideout and nook in Young’s purview. An expanding American nation was about to swallow the Great American West whole. Young obviously needed a new strategy. With only a fortune and an enchanted land to lose, both for himself and his people, the seventy-one year-old prophet was ready to more fully move his Great Game inside; inside courtrooms; inside newspaper offices; inside Congress; and most importantly, inside America. It was an historic moment, a small but significant step toward the Americanization of Mormonism.

This is not to say Young’s Great Game was over. Far from it. There would be roads, settlement corridors, exoduses, mountain retreats, and telegraph lines complete with secret codes ahead. There would continue to be rough and tumble blustering moves until the shrewd prophet died in 1877, and on and on thereafter. But somehow, going forward, the Great Game would be different. And though it would take generations, and though the process that started with that December 1871 journey is perhaps not even fully over yet, Mormons and Americans put down their weapons and inched towards becoming one people.

This is a great deal of what Pipe Springs National Monument memorializes. The “Carthage Jail Period” of Mormon history finally in the past, in the early 1920s Mormons and Gentiles worked together to preserve the old fort in the rocks their fathers once prepared to fight over. Together they found that Pipe Springs’ old roads and its fresh water linked the Grand Canyon, Zion Canyon, Bryce Canyon, and the Kaibab Reservation with the entire Kanab Country, and with the St. George Country, with its temple and its unique Mormon Country cultural history, like the hub of a wheel. Owning this proud land with the Shivwits and Kaibab Paiutes, the Mormons and the larger American public, now as one people, can enjoy “the rugged recesses of these majestic mountains” and the ancient roads that Brigham Young built Winsor Castle to keep watch over. Not just a lonely rook on a forgotten game board, Pipe Springs National Monument is a memorial of what we were, of what we are, and of what we must continue to work at becoming.
Endnotes


4 Ibid., chapter 19, especially 769–771; and *The Deseret News* as quoted in *Washington County News*, 26 January 1922, 1, Utah Digital Newspapers (hereafter UDN).

5 Peterson, “Pipe Springs” especially chapters 4 through 9.


9 The first publication of the name “Windsor Castle” spelled with a “d,” occurred in the Church’s missionary organ *The Millennial Star* published in Liverpool, England. Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, to President Horace S. Eldredge, 4 October 1870, in *Millennial Star* 32 (1870): 701. As the national crisis which prompted the construction of “Windsor Castle” evolved, and as the fort’s significance to the survival of the Prophet and his kingdom passed, the “d” was increasingly dropped from the spelling of the name of Young’s bastion.


11 The Pipe Springs range was at the height of a wet cycle when the Mormons first settled it in the 1860s and early 1870s. Since then overgrazing and long periods of drought have materially reduced its richness.

12 Antelope Island was commonly called “Church Island” at the time because of the Church’s practice of ranging some of its tithing cattle there. Cattle were driven to the Island over sandbars and would stay on the island with very little tending. Substantial numbers of southern Utah tithing herds were also kept at Cove Fort.

13 The same year the Morrill Anti-Bigamy Act was passed (1862), Congress created the position of commissioner of Internal Revenue and enacted an income tax to help
pay for the enormous costs of the Civil War. Income tax was repealed in 1872. See https://www.irs.gov/uac/Brief-History-of-IRS.

14 Peterson, “Pipe Springs,” 243–253. For detailed information regarding the Grant administration’s campaign to tax Brigham Young personally for the Church’s “tithing income,” see “Internal revenue income tax matter, 1869–1871, Communications and other documents concerning revenue assessor John P. Taggart’s attempts to tax LDS tithing,” Brigham Young Papers (hereafter BYP), CHL, r62, b49, f31 and 32. See also Testimony of John P. Taggart, United States Assessor for Utah, in H. Rpt. 21, Pt. 2, “Laws in Utah [to accompany bill H. R. No. 1089],” 41st Cong., 2d Session, 3 February 1870, 1–7, Serial Set Vol. No. 1436; and Daniel H. Wells, Salt Lake City, Utah Territory, to Prest. H. S. Eldredge, Liverpool, 24 January 1871, BYP.

15 Young clearly wanted his enemies to know of this expedition, and even while he traveled newspapers throughout the English-speaking world reported that there was “a rainy belt of country about 300 miles south of St. George, large enough for a State, which the Mormons know of. Now, in view of a possible emergency, Brigham has gone to take another and more critical look at it.” New York Tribune, 12 March 1870, quoted in Irish Times (Dublin, Ireland), 15 April 1870, 2, Newspapers.com (hereafter NC).

16 Peterson, “Last Bastion,” especially 8–15; Peterson, “Pipe Springs,” especially chapters 5 and 6; and Daniel H. Wells, Salt Lake City, Utah Territory, to Prest. H. S. Eldredge, Liverpool, 24 January 1871, BYP.


18 Peterson, “Pipe Springs.”

19 Ibid., especially 129–140; and Salt Lake Tribune, 20 November 1871, 2, UDN.


24 See David Fromkin, A Peace to End All Peace: The Fall of the Ottoman Empire and the Creation of the Modern Middle East (New York: Avon Books, 1989), 27.

25 Henry O’Rielly apparently was the first to apply the phrase “the great game” in the context of Young’s struggle with the United States when writing about the 1857–1858 Utah War in 1869. See “MORMONISM: Its Progress and Prospects — A New Nationality,” in Frank Leslie’s Illustrated Newspaper, 25 September 1869, 19, 19th Century Newspapers (hereafter NCN), Family History Library, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City, Utah (hereafter FHL).

26 For discussions of Latter-day Saint notions of Kingdom, see Robert Bruce Flanders, Nauvoo: Kingdom on the Mississippi (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1965); Klaus J. Hanson, Quest For Empire: The Political Kingdom of God and the Council of Fifty in Mormon History (East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 1970); Leonard J. Arrington, Great Basin Kingdom: Economic History of the Latter-Day

27 Proclamation of the Twelve Apostles of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, To All the Kings of the World, To the President of the United States of America; To the Governors of the Several States, and to the Rulers and People of All Nations” (Liverpool: Wilford Woodruff, 1845), especially 5.


29 “A Discourse by President Brigham Young, Delivered in the Tabernacle, Great Salt Lake City, November 9, 1856,” in George D. Watt, ed., Journal of Discourses, by Brigham Young, President of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, His Two Counsellors, and the Twelve Apostles (Liverpool: S. W. Richards, 1857), 4:77 (hereafter JD).

30 For examples see New York Times, 26 July 1869, 5, FHL; D. McKenzie, Salt Lake City, U.T., to James W. Cumming, 3 October 1871, BYU; and Lorenzo S. Lyman, Fillmore, to My Dear Father [Amasa Lyman], 2 and 6 November 1871, Amasa Lyman Collection, Selected Collections from the Archives of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, (hereafter Selected Collections), CHL.

31 JD, 6:176.

32 New York Times, 26 July 1869, 5, FHL.

33 Cleveland Leader (OH), 25 February 1873, 2, GBC.

34 The Book of Mormon, Alma 43:30.

35 Spirit of the Age (Raleigh, NC), 31 March 1858, 3, NPC; Peterson, Utah’s Black Hawk War, 114; Hartford Daily Courant (CT), 30 October 1871, 3, GBC; and Decatur Daily Republican (IL), 27 November 1876, 3, NPC.

36 Providence Evening Press (RI), 26 June 1871, 2, GBC; D. McKenzie, Salt Lake City, U. T., to James W. Cumming, 3 October 1871, Brigham Young Letterbooks, typescript, Selected Collections (hereafter BYL); Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, U. T., to Frank M. Pixley, Esq., San Francisco, 10 October 1871, BYL; and Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, U. T., to Gen. Thomas L. Kane, 27 September 1871, BYU.

37 For example see telegram of [Brigham Young?], St. George, to [Daniel H. Wells?], 14 December 1871, BYP r86, b73, f34. See also “Secret Mormon Cipher,” Thomas L. Kane to Brigham Young, 2 October 1871, John W. Young, Philadelphia, to Gen. T. L. Kane, 9 November 1871, draft of Thomas L. Kane to Brigham Young, 30 November 1871, and Brigham Young’s personal copy of Charles S. Larrabee, Larrabee’s Chipher and Secret Letter and Telegraph Code,…The Most Perfect Secret Code ever Invented or Discovered. Impossible to be Read without the Key. Invaluable for Secret, Military, Naval, and Diplomatic Services, as well as for Brokers, Bankers, and Merchants (New York: D. Van Nostrand, Publisher, 1871), all in Thomas L. Kane Papers, L. Tom Perry Special Collections, Harold B. Lee Library, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah.

38 Peterson, “Pipe Springs,” especially 207.

39 Doctrine and Covenants, 82:22; and JD, 9:368.

40 London Times, 4 March 1870, 4, NC.

41 “A Discourse by President Brigham Young, Delivered in the Tabernacle, Great Salt Lake City, July 8, 1855,” in JD, 2:312.

42 Kenney, Wilford Woodruff’s Journal, 6:468–469.
43 Peterson, *Utah's Black Hawk War*, 162.

44 Ibid.

45 *Salt Lake Tribune*, 29 December 1871, 2, UDN.


47 Samuel Bowles, *Our New West: Records of Travel between the Mississippi river and the Pacific Ocean....A Full Description of the Pacific Railroad; and of the Life of the Mormons, Indians, and Chinese.* (Hartford, CN: Hartford Publishing Co., 1869), 500–501.

48 Peterson, “Pipe Springs,” especially chapter 8.

49 An astute Mormon watcher in 1871 described Young’s corridor this way: “There are twenty counties in Utah, and all are connected by a road and telegraph system. The richest counties lie between Salt Lake City and the northern boundary, but the belt of settlements follows the general line of the western slope of the Wahsatch [sic] Mountains and stops at St. George, on the river Virgin, while there are two good lateral valleys, one toward the head-waters of the Virgin, whose farther settlement to the east is Kanab Fort, and another in the San Pete Valley, where there are several rich settlements presided over by Orson Hyde.” Townsend, *The Mormon Trials*, 35. See also Milton R. Hunter, “The Mormon Corridor,” *Pacific Historical Review* 8 (June 1939): 179–200; Arrington, *Great Basin Kingdom*, especially 86; and Edward Leo Lyman, *The Arduous Road: Salt Lake to Los Angeles, the Most Difficult Wagon Road in American History* (Victorville, CA: Lyman Historical Research and Pub. Co., 2001).

50 Peterson, *Utah's Black Hawk War*, especially 163, and 296–301.

51 Brigham Young and George A. Smith to Daniel H. Wells and “others such as you call to your aid as counsellors,” 26 October 1871, BYP.


53 John Wesley Powell indicated that Mormon settlers at Kanab used this ancient pueblo to obtain materials to build their homes until “no vestiges of the ancient structure remain.” See John Wesley Powell, *The Exploration of the Colorado River and Its Canyons* (New York: Dover Publications, inc., 1961), 107–108.

54 There is scant evidence that a handful of Latter-day Saint soldiers mustered out of the “Mormon Battalion” in California may have used this road as early as 1847. See Peterson, “Pipe Springs,” chapters 1–3, especially 20, and 67.

55 As yet a wagon road did not exist coming from the head of the Sevier River down through Alton to Kanab. In September of 1870 Young himself explored the possibilities of such a road.

56 Church Historian's Office Journal, 1844–1879, 4 June 1869, Selected Collections.

57 *Jackson Citizen Patriot* (Jackson, Michigan), 24 March 1870, 2, GBC.


60 *Springfield Republican* (MA), 26 May 1870, 2, and 18 June 1870, 2, GBC; Townsend, *The Mormon Trials*, 16; and George Q. Cannon, Washington, D.C., to George A. Smith, 29 May 1872, George A. Smith Collection, Selected Collections.

Vermont Chronicle (Bellows Falls, VT), 30 April 1870 and 11 June 1870, NCN; Weekly Arizonian (Tucson), 14 May 1870, NCN; and Daily Evening Bulletin (San Francisco, CA), 11 June 1870 and 18 October 1870, NCN.

Daily Corrine Reporter, 27 September 1871, 2, UDN.

Vermont Chronicle (Bellows Falls, VT), 30 April 1870, NCN.

Brigham Young to President Horace S. Eldredge, 4 October 1870, in Millennial Star 32 (1 November 1870): 701.

Peterson, “Pipe Springs,” 112, and 115; Tullidge, History of Salt Lake City, 482–490; and Walker, Diary, 1:318–319.

Brigham Young, George A. Smith, and Daniel H Wells, to Joseph W. Young, 29 September 1870, BYL.

Dellenbaugh, A Canyon Voyage, 185–186.

For examples see New York Sun, 21 March 1871, 2, Chronicling America, Historic American Newspapers, Library of Congress (hereafter CALOC); Washington Evening Star (Washington, D.C.), 23 March 1871, 1, GBC; Alexandria Gazette (VA), 23 March 1871, 2, GBC; Milwaukee Sentinel, 28 March 1871, NCN; and Pacific Commercial Advertiser (Honolulu), 13 May 1871, 3, CALOC.

Tullidge, History of Salt Lake City, 483, and 490.


Tullidge, History of Salt Lake City, 504. Comte Régis de Trobriand was a cousin of Simón Bolivar and a knighted European aristocrat who had renounced French citizenship to become an American. Many officers of the Nauvoo Legion were bishops, and Brigham Young, of course, was a King.

Tullidge, History of Salt Lake City, 513. Italics mine.

Weekly Pioneer (Asheville, NC), 16 November 1871, 1, NC; and Townsend, The Mormon Trials, 24–25.

George L. Woods, Governor of Utah, Executive Office, Salt Lake City, Utah Territory, to His Excellency U.S. Grant, President, &c., 2 October 1871, in PAM 15792, 1–2, Utah State Historical Society, Salt Lake City, Utah; London Times, 27 October 1871, 8, NCN; and Salt Lake Tribune, 29 December 1871, 2, UDN.

Salt Lake Herald, 13 October 1871, 1, UDN; and New York Times, 20 October 1871, NCN.

The New York Herald reported “Delegate Hooper, of Utah, is talking a great deal and to everybody.” New York Herald, 5 November 1871, 7, GBC. See also Daily Alta California (San Francisco), 6 October 1871, 2, California Digital Newspaper Collection; New York Herald, 26 October 1871, 3, 2 November 1871, 7, and 3 November 1871, 4, GBC; Portland Daily Press (ME), 30 October 1871, 3, GBC; and Quincy Daily Whig (IL), 3 November 1871, 2, GBC.

Salt Lake Tribune, 29 December 1871, 2, UDN.

Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, U.T., to Ben Holladay, Portland, Oregon, 20 October 1871, BYL; Salt Lake Tribune, 20 November 1871, 2, UDN; Boston Traveler, 30 October 1871, 2, GBC; Daily Albany Argus (NY), 3 November 1871, 1, GBC; New
Lincoln County Herald (Troy, MO), 26 October 1871, 2, GBC.

Hartford Daily Courant (CT), 30 October 1871, 3, GBC.

Joseph F. Smith, Salt Lake City, to John Henry Smith, 2 November 1871, Joseph F. Smith Papers, Selected Collections.

For example, see Sacramento Daily Union, 25 October 1871, 1, California Digital Newspaper Collection.

Brigham Young and George A. Smith to Daniel H. Wells and “others such as you call to your aid as counsellors,” 26 October 1871, BYP.

Auburn Daily Bulletin (NY), 7 November 1871, 2, GBC; and Leavenworth Weekly Times (KS), 16 November 1871, 2, NPC.

Townsend, The Mormon Trials, 37; Ogden Junction (UT), 29 November 1871, 1, GBC; and Cincinnati Commercial Tribune, 13 November 1871, 1–2, GBC.

Brigham Young, Salt Lake City, U.T., to Ben Holladay, Portland, Oregon, 20 October 1871.

New York Herald, 4 November 1871, 10, GBC.

New York Herald, 16 November 1871, 5, GBC; and Salt Lake Tribune, 10 November 1871, 2, UDN.

Townsend, The Mormon Trials, 10–11, 17, 22, and 34.

Salt Lake Tribune, 23 November 1871, 2, UDN.

Sacramento Reporter as quoted in Ogden Junction (UT), 25 November 1871, 1, GBC. Italics mine.

New York Herald, 4 November 1871, 10, and 5 November 1871, 7, GBC; JH, 4 November 1871, 2; and Cincinnati Commercial Tribune, 13 November 1871, 1–2, GBC.

Salt Lake Tribune, 28 November 1871, 2, UDN.

Journal of the Senate of the United States of America, being the second session of the Forty-second Congress; begun and held at the City of Washington, December 4, 1871, in the Ninety-sixth year of the Independence of the United States, 17, Serial Set Vol. No. 1477, GBC.

For example see the Salt Lake Tribune quoting the Elko Independent, in Salt Lake Tribune, 13 November 1871, 3.

George L. Woods, Governor of Utah, to His Excellency U.S. Grant, President, &c., 2 October 1871, 2.

Brigham Young, Fillmore, to D. H. Wells, A. Carrington, and D. McKenzie, 28 October 1871, BYP.


P. T. Reilly, Lee’s Ferry: From Mormon Crossing to National Park, ed. Robert H. Webb with contributions by Richard D. Quartaroli, (Logan, Ut: Utah State University Press, 1999) 23; and John D. Lee and William W. Bishop, Mormonism Unveiled; or the Life and Confessions of the Late Mormon Bishop, John D. Lee; (Written by Himself) Embracing a History of Mormonism from its Inception Down to the Present Time, with an Exposition of the Secret History, Signs, Symbols and Crimes of the Mormon Church, Also the True History of the Horrible Butchery Known as the Mountain Meadows Massacre (St. Louis: Bryan, Brand & Company, 1877), 266.
At the time of the 4 July 1871 showdown between the Nauvoo Legion and Federal troops, the Deseret Telegraph Line already had 600 miles of wire functioning in Mormondom. Perhaps as part of the military posturing regarding the “Fourth of July Parade,” on 5 July Musser announced plans to add an additional 400 miles of wire including a hundred mile line extending “from Toker, via Virgen City, Rockville, Short Creek, Windsor Castle, Kanab, to Long Valley in Kane Co.” Deseret News, 5 July 1871, 1, UDN.


Bleak, “Annals of the Southern Mission,” 2:128–129; Brigham Young, St. George, to Albert Carrington, 8 November 1871, BYP; John Henry Smith, St. George, to Joseph F. Smith, 3 December 1871, Joseph F. Smith Papers, Selected Collections; Brigham Young, St. George, to Elder George Reynolds, 11 December 1871, BYP; and “Elijah Averett Journal,” 21, Special Collections, Marriott Library, University of Utah.

Brigham Young, St. George, to Elder George Reynolds, 11 December 1871.

Sacramento Daily Union, 9 December 1871, 2, California Digital Newspaper Collection.

New York Herald, 13 December 1871, 6, GBC.

Salt Lake Tribune, 28 November 1871, 2.

Luna Thatcher, Salt Lake City, to Dear Darling George, 11 December 1871, Philip Blair Family Papers, Special Collections, University of Utah.

Salt Lake Tribune, 28 December 1871, 2, UDN.

“The Times are Changing,” Salt Lake Tribune, 27 April 1872, UDN.

Salt Lake Tribune, 2 April 1871, 2, UDN.


